Supporting a Healthy Work Environment and Just Culture in the Emergency Care Setting

Description

Healthy work environments and just culture are associated with improved nursing outcomes such as increased autonomy and control over practice; increased job satisfaction; and decreased nurse burnout, sick time, and turnover (Canady & Allen, 2015; Halm, 2019; McHugh et al. 2016; Shirey, 2017). Characteristics of unhealthy work environments include high workload, low decision authority, low support, poor communication, abusive behavior, disrespect, resistance to change, lack of vision or leadership, distrust, conflict with values, mission and vision, and loss of understanding of the central purpose of professional duties (Wang et al., 2020). In 2004, the Institute of Medicine (IOM) report, Keeping Patients Safe: Transforming the Work Environment of Nurses, identified the need for transformational nurse leadership in order to develop and sustain a healthy work environment. Subsequently, the American Association of Critical Care Nurses (AACN) developed Standards for Establishing and Sustaining Healthy Work Environments in 2005 (AACN, 2005) and updated the document in 2016 (AACN, 2016). The AACN work group identified six standards to demonstrate healthy work environments: skilled communication, true collaboration, effective decision making, appropriate staffing, meaningful recognition, and authentic leadership (AACN, 2005). While the document does not address “just culture” per se, the standards on skilled communications and true collaboration speak to the definition.

The term “just culture” was first used in 2001 and widely adopted by hospitals following the release of the 1999 50 Institute of Medicine (IOM), now the National Academy of Medicine, report To Err is Human (IOM, 2000) (Heath et al., 2004; Willemsen et al., 2016). Just culture is an organizational practice where both leadership and employees share responsibility for supporting practices that create a healthy work environment, where errors are acknowledged by responding to incidents or near misses in a fair and just manner through trust, transparency, and open communication (CMPA, 2021; Maassen et al., 2021; Marx, 2019; Paradiso & Sweeney, 2019; van Baarle et al., 2022). Unfortunately, people make errors. “Transparent, just, and timely reporting mechanisms of medical errors, without the fear of criminalization, preserve safe patient care environments” (ANA, 2022). The evidence is clear that transformative leadership incorporates the essential characteristics to achieve, establish, and maintain a healthy work environment (Shirey, 2017; Wei et al., 2018).

A crucial component of a healthy work environment in healthcare is safe staffing. Several factors contribute to safe staffing, including patient census and acuity, length of time required for care delivery, experience and educational preparation of the staff (e.g., advanced practice, baccalaureate or associate degree, nursing diploma, unlicensed staff) (Starr-Rogers, 2021; Wolf et al., 2017). Integral to safe staffing is the inclusion of rest breaks, meal breaks, and debriefing after critical events. While researchers support the inclusion of breaks and debriefing in the emergency department (ED), widespread variability exists in the clinical setting. (Kessler et al., 2015). Bullying and violence may hamper the safety of staff, patients, and visitors in the ED (Lenaghan et al., 2018; Wolf et al., 2014; Wolf et al., 2018). It is imperative that leaders work to identify and apply a systematic, easily accessible method of reporting and responding to episodes of bullying and violence.

The Just Culture model focuses on improving system design and managing at-risk behaviors by creating an open and fair learning culture geared towards designing safe systems and managing behavioral choices resulting in successful outcomes (Marx, 2019). The focus of the Just Culture model is on the prevention of harm before it occurs, and as such, has documented success in reducing errors and improving outcomes.
According to the Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA, 2015, 2016, & n.d.), a first step in developing a plan to address workplace violence/bullying in the ED should start with implementation of a screening tool to identify the existence and characteristics of bullying and workplace violence. Nurse leaders need to collaborate with key stakeholders to identify and implement evidence-based policies and procedures. Through collaboration, they can establish best practices to promote a just culture, a healthy work environment that mitigates workplace violence, while improving patient outcomes; and staff satisfaction. Researchers have identified a correlation between these negative characteristics and decreases in nurse satisfaction and retention, patient safety, worsened patient outcomes, and lower care quality. All of these factors are detrimental to healthcare organizations because they result in human suffering and nurse turnover with its resulting financial cost (Recio-Saucedo et al., 2015; Wei et al., 2018; World Health Organization, 2022).

The essential role of leadership in developing a safety culture is a transparent and non-punitive approach to event reporting, which is critical to promoting learning from adverse events, close calls, and unsafe conditions (TJC, 2021). Leading a Culture of Safety: A Blueprint for Success, co-authored by representatives of the American College of Healthcare Executives and The National Patient Safety Foundation’s Lucian Leape Institute (2017), establishes six leadership domains requiring leadership to focus on developing and sustaining a culture of safety. “Lead and Reward a Just Culture” is one of the identified leadership domains. This blueprint notes a just culture recognizes that punishing people for mistakes will discourage reporting, which leads to failure to rectify problems in the system, and setting the stage for recurrence of the error. Delivering safe nursing practice and safe patient care requires the integration of many complex factors working together simultaneously.

ENA Position

It is the position of the Emergency Nurses Association (ENA) that:

1. Leadership and healthcare workers have a mutual responsibility to create collaborative values that support a just culture, healthy work environment, and both personal and organizational accountability.

2. Healthcare workers and leadership share responsibility for respectful, professional, and effective communication with zero tolerance for intimidation, abusiveness, or bullying from any source.

3. Leadership and healthcare workers strive to identify and assess workplace violence triggers and support the implementation of an effective workplace violence prevention program to mitigate violence and its impact.

4. Leadership make resources and education available in the workplace for sustaining the physical and psychological needs of the healthcare worker, such as safe staffing levels, reduction of fatigue-related risks, protected mealtimes, and opportunities to debrief after critical events.

5. Emergency nurses and nurse researchers use current evidence to recommend best practices aimed at creating healthy work environments.

Background

Researchers have identified characteristics of a healthy nursing work environment as including a...
productive and collaborative setting in which nurses and other healthcare workers are free from physical
and psychosocial harm (Wei et al., 2018; WHO, n.d.; TJC, 2016). At the same time such a work
environment should enable them to maximize their ability to provide safe, quality care as well as meet
personal needs and empower them to promote a satisfying work experience (Wei et al., 2018; WHO, n.d.;
TJC, 2016). (Page or IOM, 2004; TJC, 2021; Wei et al., 2018; WHO, 2020). A just culture along with a
culture of safety depends on the collective attitude of stakeholders at all levels, with everyone taking
responsibility for safety and safe practice in the work environment which can lead to increased safety and
decreased injuries for patients and staff (Kanaskie & Snyder, 2018; Marx, 2019; van Baarle, 2022). A
healthy work environment is multifaceted. Research has supported the intricate connections between the
many personnel and organizational factors that contribute to a healthy work environment.

A key to providing and sustaining a healthy work environment is quality leadership. Shirey (2017)
identified four themes describing necessary leadership practices to maintain a healthy work environment:
quality leadership, relational exchanges, environmental elements, and contextual factors. Leaders who
maintained positive relationships with staff and demonstrated competence as a leader were identified as
being effective in establishing healthy work environments. Important environmental factors centered on a
supportive employer who is receptive to the needs of the nursing workforce. A recent review of nurse
work environments indicates that healthy work environments are strategic in maintaining a stable and
sufficient nursing workforce, promoting hospital efficiency and safety, encouraging positive nurse
performance and productivity, improving patient care quality, and supporting a healthcare organization’s
financial viability (Wei et al., 2018).

A just culture improves patient safety through the creation of an environment of shared accountability,
evaluating systems and individual behavioral choices (ANA, 2010). There are three types of behaviors
leading to mistakes: human error, at-risk behaviors, and reckless behaviors. Human error is an inadvertent
action or inadvertently doing something other than what should have been done. At-risk behaviors are
those which increase risk where risk is not recognized or is mistakenly believed to be justified. The
Institute of Safe Medication Practices (ISMP, 2012) found that reckless behavior is a choice to
consciously disregard a substantial and unjustifiable risk. The Joint Commission (TJC) urges
organizations to establish a safety culture, which promotes trust. The Joint Commission’s Comprehensive
Accreditation Manual for Hospitals (2022) outlines leadership safety culture components. One
compartment, Accountability/Just Culture, calls on leaders to “provide and encourage the use of systems for
blame-free internal reporting of a system or process failure, or the results of a proactive risk assessment”
(TJC, 2018, p. 2).

A punitive approach will not solve the problem. Individuals may be at fault, and the system is also at
fault. To achieve a just culture, the American Nurses Association (ANA) supports partnerships among
state boards of nursing, professional nursing and hospital associations, and individual healthcare
organizations (ANA, 2010). The recent criminalization of a health care provider’s actions leads to
concern that such criminalization may stifle open and transparent learning as healthcare providers weigh
the risks of disclosing an error within their organization or reporting an error (ISMP, 2012). A healthy and
just work environment is safe, productive, and satisfying (ANA, 2001; Mabona et al., 2022; Essential to
developing and maintaining a healthy work environment is the concept of a just culture. The ANA (2010)
identified a just culture as an environment where individual healthcare workers are not held responsible
for systems or organizational failure (ANA, 2010). According to Marx, (2019) a just culture framework
should be proactive and preventative not reactive designed to address the potential inherent risks within the healthcare system. (ANA, 2010). Keys to a just culture include learning from errors after incidents occur while fostering patient safety with attention to learning rather than blaming thus showing support to staff (Marx, 2019; van Baarle, 2022).

It is recommended that safe staffing policies include intermittent breaks and meal breaks (Starr-Rogers, 2021). Sufficient, quality rest breaks during work shifts are a key part of decreasing nurse fatigue and increasing attention to details and standards of safe patient care (Leaver, 2018; ANA, 2014; Starr-Rogers, 2021) Many hospitals have policies stipulating rest and meal breaks for nurses. However, frequently nurses do not receive these breaks due to demanding patient assignments and inadequate staffing (Patricelli, 2016). Although currently there is no single standard across all states for rest and meal breaks, evidence suggests the importance of breaks for nurses as related to patient safety (Buppert, 2017; Sixel, 2016; Washington State Nurses Association, 2018).

Additionally, integral to the promotion of safe patient care is debriefing after critical events. Debriefing after critical events has been identified as an effective means of increasing positive patient outcomes through the evaluation of staff performance and the implementation of effective processes (Kessler et al., 2015). Debriefings can be an economical method of highlighting positive actions and identifying areas for improvement and retraining without negatively isolating individual team members. Researchers indicate that when debriefing after critical events is used in the clinical setting, individual and team performance can improve by 25% in future critical events (Twigg, 2020).

Consumer and relational violence are a significant contributing factor to an unhealthy work environment. Researchers highlight that violence against nurses perpetrated by patients and visitors is as much as three times higher than violence against all other workers, resulting in injuries and increased stress which exert a negative effect on nurse productivity (Dressner & Kissinger, 2018; Potera, 2016). Among healthcare environments, ED and mental health inpatient departments are considered to be the highest risk areas for staff, patients, families, and visitors (Lenaghan et al., 2018). In addition, relational violence (workplace bullying) poses a significant threat to patient safety (TJC, 2021) and is a contributing factor to nurse dissatisfaction and turnover (TJC, 2016; Sauer & McCoy, 2018). Sauer and McCoy (2018) reported that as many as 40% of nurses routinely experience bullying in the workplace. Left unchecked, bullying of nurses not only has a high probability of decreasing nurse retention but also of leading to negative patient outcomes (Wolf et al., 2018).

In 2015, ANA developed a position statement that promoted zero tolerance of workplace violence (ANA, 2015). This policy launched an organizational campaign whereby violence against nurses in the workplace, regardless of the source or type of violence, would no longer be allowed or accepted as a mere side effect of nursing practice (ANA, 2015). Staff education on bullying and enforcement of a zero-tolerance policy for bullying can be a factor in increasing nurse retention and satisfaction. ENA supports a zero-tolerance policy of violence in the workplace that includes bullying and identifies hospital leadership as key to developing and instituting these policies (Wolf et al., 2019). The adoption of standards of evidence-based practice supported by evidence is critical to the development and maintenance of a healthy and just work environment.
Resources


References


24. McHugh, M. D., Rochman, M. F., Sloane, D. M., Berg, R. A., Mancini, M. E., Nadkarni, V. M.,


Authors and Reviewers
How to Reference This Document


This position statement, including the information and recommendations set forth herein, reflects ENA’s current position with respect to the subject matter discussed herein based on current knowledge at the time of publication. This position statement is only current as of its publication date and is subject to change without notice as new information and advances emerge. The positions, information, and recommendations discussed herein are not codified into law or regulations. In addition, variations in practice that take into account the needs of the individual patient and the resources and limitations unique to the institution may warrant approaches, treatments, and/or procedures that differ from the recommendations outlined in this position statement. Therefore, this position statement should not be construed as dictating an exclusive course of management, treatment, or care, nor does adherence to this position statement guarantee a particular outcome. ENA’s position statements are never intended to replace a practitioner’s best nursing judgment based on the clinical circumstances of a particular patient or patient population. Position statements are published by ENA for educational and informational purposes only, and ENA does not “approve” or “endorse” any specific sources of information referenced herein. ENA assumes no liability for any injury and/or damage to persons or property arising out of or related to the use of or reliance on any position statement.